



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

The American Economic Review

Volume VII, No. 1 SUPPLEMENT

March 1917

Papers and Proceedings
of the
Twenty-ninth Annual Meeting
of the
American Economic Association

COLUMBUS, OHIO
DECEMBER, 1916

Publication Office : Princeton, N. J.
Subscriptions : American Economic Association, Ithaca, N. Y.

Entered at the Post Office, Princeton, N. J., as second-class matter

Price, in paper, \$1.25

AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Organized at Saratoga, September 9, 1885

OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1917

President

JOHN R. COMMONS, University of Wisconsin

Vice-Presidents

JAMES E. LEROSSIGNOL, University of Nebraska

MURRAY S. WILDMAN, Stanford University

GEORGE RAY WICKER, Dartmouth College

Secretary and Treasurer

ALLYN A. YOUNG, Cornell University

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

(In addition to the above officers)

Past Presidents

*FRANCIS A. WALKER, Massachusetts Inst. of Technology

*CHARLES F. DUNBAR, Harvard University

JOHN B. CLARK, Columbia University

HENRY C. ADAMS, University of Michigan

ARTHUR T. HADLEY, Yale University

RICHARD T. ELY, University of Wisconsin

EDWIN R. A. SELIGMAN, Columbia University

FRANK W. TAUSSIG, Harvard University

JEREMIAH W. JENKS, New York University

SIMON N. PATTEN, University of Pennsylvania

DAVIS R. DEWEY, Massachusetts Inst. of Technology

EDMUND J. JAMES, University of Illinois

HENRY W. FARNAM, Yale University

FRANK A. FETTER, Princeton University

DAVID KINLEY, University of Illinois

JOHN H. GRAY, University of Minnesota

WALTER F. WILLCOX, Cornell University

THOMAS N. CARVER, Harvard University

Elected Members

ROGER W. BABSON, Wellesley Hills, Mass.

WESLEY C. MITCHELL, Columbia University

FRED R. FAIRCHILD, Yale University

WILLIAM H. GLASSON, Trinity College, N. C.

WILLIAM F. GEPHART, Washington University

LEON C. MARSHALL, University of Chicago

Managing Editor of the American Economic Review

DAVIS R. DEWEY, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Boston

Editorial Board

HERBERT J. DAVENPORT, Cornell University

CLIVE DAY, Yale University

JOHN L. COULTER, West Virginia University

THOMAS W. PAGE, University of Virginia

FRANK A. FETTER, Princeton University

HERBERT E. MILLS, Vassar College

Inquiries and other communications regarding membership, meetings, and the general affairs of the Association, as well as orders for publications, should be addressed to the Secretary of the American Economic Association, Ithaca, N. Y.

*Deceased.

PUBLICATIONS OF THE
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

1917

Publications of the American Economic Association

FIRST SERIES

Any volume in paper, \$4.00; in cloth, \$5.00 for a single volume, \$4.00 for each additional volume ordered at the same time. Vol. XI, in paper, \$2.00; in cloth, \$2.50.

Set of 11 volumes in cloth, with index, \$41.00.

*Numbers starred are sold only with the set; but those double starred can be obtained in revised edition. For information apply to the Secretary.

Volume I, 1886

	Price in paper
1. Report of Organization of the American Economic Association. Pp. 46.	\$.50
2-3. *Relation of the Modern Municipality to the Gas Supply. By E. J. James. Pp. 66.	.75
4. Coöperation in a Western City. By Albert Shaw. Pp. 106.	.75
5. Coöperation in New England. By E. W. Bemis. Pp. 136.	.75
6. *Relation of the State to Industrial Action. By H. C. Adams. Pp. 85.	.75

Volume II, 1887

1. Three Phases of Coöperation in the West. By Amos G. Warner. Pp. 119.	.75
2. Historical Sketch of the Finances of Pennsylvania. By T. K. Worthington. Pp. 106.	.75
3. The Railway Question. By Edmund J. James. Pp. 68.	.75
4. Early History of the English Woolen Industry. By W. J. Ashley. Pp. 85.	.75
5. Mediaeval Guilds of England. By E. R. A. Seligman. Pp. 113.	.75
6. Relation of Modern Municipalities to Quasi-Public Works. By H. C. Adams and others. Pp. 87.	.75

Volume III, 1888

1. Statistics in College, by C. D. Wright; Sociology and Political Economy, by F. H. Giddings; The Legal-Tender Decisions, by E. J. James. Pp. 80.	.75
2. Capital and Its Earnings. By John B. Clark. Pp. 69.	.75
3. The Manual Laboring Class, by F. A. Walker; Mine Labor in the Hocking Valley, by E. W. Bemis; Report of the Second Annual Meeting. Pp. 86.	.75
4-5. ** Statistics and Economics. By Richmond Mayo-Smith. Pp. 127.	1.00
6. The Stability of Prices. By Simon N. Patten. Pp. 64.	.75

Volume IV, 1889

1. Contributions to the Wages Question: The Theory of Wages, by Stuart Wood; Possibility of a Scientific Law of Wages, by J. B. Clark. Pp. 69.	.75
2. Socialism in England. By Sidney Webb. Pp. 73.	.75
3. Road Legislation for the American State. By J. W. Jenks. Pp. 83.	.75
4. Third Annual Meeting: Report of the Proceedings. Pp. 123.	.75
5. Malthus and Ricardo, by S. N. Patten; The Study of Statistics, by D. R. Dewey; Analysis in Political Economy, by W. W. Folwell. Pp. 69.	.75
6. An Honest Dollar. By E. Benjamin Andrews. Pp. 50.	.75

Publications of the American Economic Association

Volume V, 1890

1. The Industrial Transition in Japan. By Yeijiro Ono. Pp. 122. 1.00
2. Two Essays on Child-Labor. By W. F. Willoughby and Clare de Graffenried. Pp. 150. .75
- 3-4. Papers on the Canal Question. By E. J. James and L. M. Haupt. Pp. 85. 1.00
5. History of the New York Property Tax. By J. C. Schwab. Pp. 108. 1.00
6. The Educational Value of Political Economy. By S. N. Patten. Pp. 36. .75

Volume VI, 1891

- 1-2. Fourth Annual Meeting: Reports, Papers, Discussions. 1.00
3. Government Forestry. Papers by Pinchot, Bowers, and Fernow. Pp. 102. .75
- 4-5. Municipal Ownership of Gas in the U. S. By E. W. Bemis. Pp. 185. 1.00
6. State Railroad Commissions. By F. C. Clark. Pp. 110. .75

Volume VII, 1892

1. * The Silver Situation in the United States. By F. W. Taussig. Pp. 118. .75
- 2-3. **Shifting and Incidence of Taxation. By E. R. A. Seligman. Pp. 424 (Revised). 2.00
- 4-5. Sinking Funds. By Edward A. Ross. Pp. 106. 1.00
6. The Reciprocity Treaty with Canada of 1854. By F. E. Haynes. Pp. 70. .75

Volume VIII, 1893

1. Fifth Annual Meeting: Report of the Proceedings. Pp. 130. .75
- 2-3. Housing of the Poor in American Cities. By M. T. Reynolds. Pp. 132. 1.00
- 4-5. Public Assistance of the Poor in France. By E. G. Balch. Pp. 180. 1.00
6. First Stages of the Tariff Policy of the U. S. By William Hill. Pp. 162. 1.00

Volume IX, 1894

- Sixth Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 73. .50
- 1-2. **Progressive Taxation in Theory and Practice. By Edwin R. A. Seligman. Pp. 222. (*See 1908, No. 4.*) 1.00
3. The Theory of Transportation. By C. H. Cooley. Pp. 148. .75
4. Sir William Petty. By Wilson Lloyd Bevan. Pp. 102. .75
- 5-6. Papers on Labor Problems. By J. B. Clark, C. D. Wright, D. R. Dewey, A. T. Hadley, and J. G. Brooks. Pp. 94. .75

Volume X, 1895

- Seventh Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 138. .50
- 1-3. The Canadian Banking System, 1817-1890. By R. M. Breckenridge. Pp. 478. 1.50
4. Poor Laws of Massachusetts and New York. By John Cummings. Pp. 136. .75
- 5-6. Letters of Ricardo to McCulloch, 1816-1823. Edited by J. H. Hollander. Pp. 204. (*In Cloth, \$1.75.*) 1.25

Volume XI, 1896

- 1-3. Race Traits and Tendencies of the American Negro. By F. L. Hoffman. Pp. 330. 1.25
4. Appreciation and Interest. By Irving Fisher. Pp. 110. .75
- * General Index to Volumes I-XI (1886-1896). .25

Publications of the American Economic Association

ECONOMIC STUDIES

Price of the Economic Studies \$2.50 per volume in paper, \$3.00 in cloth. The set of four volumes, in cloth, \$10.00.

Volume I, 1896

- Eighth Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 178. .50
1. The Theory of Economic Progress, by J. B. Clark; The Relation of Changes in the Volume of the Currency to Prosperity. By F. A. Walker. Pp. 46. .50
 2. The Adjustment of Wages to Efficiency. Three Papers: Gain Sharing, by H. R. Towne; The Premium Plan, by F. A. Halsey; A Piece-Rate System, by F. W. Taylor. Pp. 83. .50
 3. The Populist Movement. By Frank L. McVey. Pp. 81. .50
 4. The Present Monetary Situation. By W. Lexis. Translated by John Cummings. Pp. 72. .50
 - 5-6. The Street Railway Problem in Cleveland. By W. R. Hopkins. Pp. 94. .75

Volume II, 1897

- Ninth Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 162. .50
1. Economics and Jurisprudence. By Henry C. Adams. Pp. 48. .50
 2. The Saloon Question in Chicago. By John E. George. Pp. 62. .50
 3. The General Property Tax in California. By C. C. Plehn. Pp. 88. .50
 4. Area and Population of the United States at the Eleventh Census. By W. F. Willcox. Pp. 60. .50
 5. A Discussion Concerning the Currencies of the British Plantations in America, etc. By William Douglass. Edited by C. J. Bullock. Pp. 228. .50
 6. Density and Distribution of Population in the United States at the Eleventh Census. By W. F. Willcox. Pp. 79. .50

Volume III, 1898

- Tenth Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 136. .50
1. Government by Injunction. By William H. Dunbar. Pp. 44. .50
 2. Economic Aspects of Railroad Receiverships. By H. H. Swain. Pp. 118. .50
 3. The Ohio Tax Inquisitor Law. By T. N. Carver. Pp. 50. .50
 4. The American Federation of Labor. By Morton A. Aldrich. Pp. 54. .50
 5. Housing of the Working People in Yonkers. By E. L. Bogart. Pp. 82. .50
 6. The State Purchase of Railways in Switzerland. By Horace Michelié; translated by John Cummings. Pp. 72. .50

Volume IV, 1899

- Eleventh Annual Meeting: Hand-Book and Report. Pp. 126. .50
1. I. Economics and Politics. By A. T. Hadley. II. Report on Currency Reform. III. Report on the Twelfth Census. Pp. 70. .50
 2. Personal Competition. By Charles H. Cooley. Pp. 104. .50
 3. Economics as a School Study. By F. R. Clow. Pp. 72. .50
 - 4-5. The English Income Tax. By J. A. Hill. Pp. 162. 1.00
 - 6 (and last). *Effects of Recent Changes in Monetary Standards upon the Distribution of Wealth. By F. S. Kinder. Pp. 91. .50

NEW SERIES

1. The Cotton Industry. By M. B. Hammond. Pp. 382. (*In cloth \$2.00.*) 1.50
 2. Scope and Method of the Twelfth Census. Critical discussion by over twenty statistical experts. Pp. 625. (*In cloth \$2.50.*) 2.00
- Both volumes, *in cloth*, \$4.00.

Publications of the American Economic Association

THIRD SERIES

NOTE.—During 1896-1899 the Association issued its publications in two series, viz.: the bi-monthly Economic Studies, and the "New Series" of larger monographs printed at irregular intervals. In 1900 it reverted to the policy of issuing its monographs, now called the "Third Series" of the publications, at quarterly intervals.

Volume I, 1900

1. Twelfth Annual Meeting: Papers on Economic Theory and Political Morality; Trusts; Railroad Problems; Public Finance; Consumers' League; Twelfth Census. Pp. 186. 1.00
2. The End of Villainage in England. By T. W. Page. Pp. 99. 1.00
3. Essays in Colonial Finance. By members of the Association. Pp. 303. 1.50
4. Currency and Banking in the Province of Massachusetts Bay. By A. McF. Davis. Part I: Currency. Pp. 464 + 19 photogravure plates. (*In cloth \$2.00.*) 1.75

Volume II, 1901

1. Thirteenth Annual Meeting: Papers on Competition; Commercial Education; Economic Theory; Taxation of Quasi-public Corporations; Municipal Accounts. Pp. 300. 1.25
2. Currency and Banking. By A. McF. Davis. Part II: Banking. Pp. 341 + 18 photogravure plates. (*In cloth \$2.00.*) 1.75
3. Theory of Value before Adam Smith. By Hannah R. Sewall. Pp. 132. 1.00
4. Administration of City Finances in the U. S. By F. R. Clow. Pp. 144. 1.00

Volume III, 1902

1. Fourteenth Annual Meeting: Papers on International Trade; Industrial Policy; Public Finance; Protective Tariff; Negro Problem; Arbitration of Labor Disputes; Porto Rican Finance; Economic History. Pp. 400. 1.50
2. *The Negro in Africa and America. By Joseph A. Tillinghast. Pp. 240. (*In cloth \$1.50.*) 1.25
3. Taxation in New Hampshire. By M. H. Robinson. Pp. 232. 1.25
4. Rent in Modern Economic Theory. By Alvin S. Johnson. Pp. 136. .75

Volume IV, 1903

1. Fifteenth Annual Meeting: Papers and Discussions on Economics and Social Progress. Trade Unions and the Open Shop; Railway Regulation; Theory of Wages; Theory of Rent; Oriental Currency Problem. Pp. 298. 1.25
2. Ethnic Factors in the Population of Boston. By F. A. Bushee. Pp. 171. 1.00
3. History of Contract Labor in the Hawaiian Islands. By Katharine Coman. Pp. 74. .75
4. The Income Tax in the Commonwealths of the United States. By Delos O. Kinsman. Pp. 134. 1.00

Volume V, 1904

- Sixteenth Annual Meeting. Papers and Proceedings published in two parts.
1. Part I—Papers and Discussions on Southern Agricultural and Industrial Problems; Social Aspects of Economic Law; Relations Between Rent and Interest. Pp. 240. 1.00
 - Southern Economic Problems. Reprinted from part I. .50
 - Relations Between Rent and Interest. By Frank A. Fetter and others. Reprinted from part I. .50
 2. Part II—Papers and Discussions on The Management of the Surplus Reserve; Theory of Loan Credit in Relation to Corporation Economics; State Taxation of Interstate Commerce; Trusts; Theory of Social Causation. 1.00
 - Theory of Social Causation. By Frank H. Giddings and others. Reprinted from part 2. .50

Publications of the American Economic Association

3. **Monopolistic Combinations in the German Coal Industry.** By Francis Walker. Pp. 340. 1.25
4. **The Influence of Farm Machinery on Production and Labor.** By Hadley Winfield Quaintance. Pp. 110. .75

Volume VI, 1905

- Seventeenth Annual Meeting.** Papers and Proceedings published in two parts.
1. **Part I—Papers and Discussions on the Doctrine of Free Trade; Theory of Prices; Theory of Money; Open Shop or Closed Shop.** Pp. 226. 1.00
 2. **Part II—Papers and Discussions on Government Interference with Industrial Combinations; Regulation of Railway Rates; Taxation of Railways; Preferential Tariffs and Reciprocity; Inclosure Movement; Economic History of the United States.** Pp. 270. 1.00
 3. ***The History and Theory of Shipping Subsidies.** By R. Meeker. Pp. 230. 1.00
 4. **History of Labor Legislation in New York.** By F. R. Fairchild. Pp. 218. 1.00

Volume VII, 1906

1. **Eighteenth Annual Meeting: Papers and Discussions on The Love of Wealth and the Public Service; Theory of Distribution; Government Regulation of Railway Rates; Municipal Ownership; Labor Disputes; The Economic Future of the Negro.** Pp. 325. 1.00
2. **Railroad Rate Control.** By H. S. Smalley. Pp. 147. 1.00
3. **On Collective Phenomena and the Scientific Value of Statistical Data.** By E. G. F. Gryzanovski. Pp. 48. .75
- Hand-Book of the Association, 1906. Pp. 48. .25
4. **The Taxation of the Gross Receipts of Railways in Wisconsin.** By G. E. Snider. Pp. 138. 1.00

Volume VIII, 1907

1. **Nineteenth Annual Meeting: Papers and Discussions on Modern Standards of Business Honor; Wages as Determined by Arbitration; Commercial Education; Money and Banking; Western Civilization and Birth Rate; Economic History; Government Regulation of Insurance; Trusts and Tariff; Child Labor.** Pp. 268. 1.00
2. **Historical Sketch of the Finances and Financial Policy of Massachusetts from 1780 to 1905.** By C. J. Bullock. Pp. 144. 1.00
- Hand-Book of the Association, 1907. Pp. 50. .25
3. **The Labor Legislation of Connecticut.** By Alba M. Edwards. Pp. 322. 1.00
4. **The Growth of Large Fortunes.** By G. P. Watkins, Pp. 170. 1.00

Volume IX, 1908

- Hand-Book of the Association, 1908.** Pp. 49. .25
1. **Twentieth Annual Meeting: Papers and Discussions on Principles of Government Control of Business; Economic Theory; Agricultural Economics; Money and Banking; Agreements in Political Economy; Labor Legislation; Relation of the Federal Treasury to the Money Market; Public Service Commissions.** Pp. 311. 1.25
 2. **Chicago Traction.** By R. E. Heilman. Pp. 131. 1.00
 3. **Factory Legislation of Rhode Island.** By J. K. Towles. Pp. 110. 1.00
 4. **Progressive Taxation in Theory and Practice.** Revised Edition. By E. R. A. Seligman. Pp. 334. (*In cloth \$1.75.*) 1.25

Volume X, 1909

1. **Twenty-first Annual Meeting: Papers and Discussions on The Making of Economic Literature; Collective Bargaining; Round Table on Accounting; Labor Legislation; Employers' Liability; Canadian Industrial Disputes Act; Modern Industry and Family Life; Agricultural Economics; Transportation; Revision of the Tariff; A Central Bank;**

The
American Economic Review

VOL. VII, No. 1

SUPPLEMENT

MARCH, 1917

Papers and Proceedings

of the

Twenty-ninth Annual Meeting

of the

American Economic Association

COLUMBUS, OHIO

DECEMBER, 1916

Publication Office : Princeton, N. J.

Subscriptions: American Economic Association, Ithaca, N. Y.

Copyright, 1917, by
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Printed by
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Program of Annual Meeting.....	1
The National Point of View in Economics, Annual Address of the President, by Thomas N. Carver	3
Landed Property as an Economic Concept and As a Field of Research, by Richard T. Ely	18
Discussion:	
F. A. Fetter	34
E. Dana Durand	36
B. H. Hibbard	40
R. G. Blakey	43
R. R. Bowker	46
J. A. Ryan	47
R. T. Ely	47
Two Dimensions of Productivity, with Agricultural Illustrations by Henry C. Taylor	50
Discussion:	
E. Dana Durand	58
A. A. Young	58
J. G. Thompson	59
F. A. Fetter	60
The Results of Some Rural Social Surveys in Iowa, by George H. Von Tungeln	62
Discussion:	
P. S. Peirce	87
G. H. Von Tungeln	90
The Land Problem and Rural Welfare, by Paul L. Vogt	91
Discussion:	
W. O. Hedrick	102
J. B. Morman	104
G. H. Von Tungeln	111
The Federal Farm Loan Act, by C. W. Thompson.....	115
Discussion:	
K. N. Robins	132
J. B. Morman	135
Do the Statistics of the Concentration of Wealth in the United States Mean What They are Commonly Assumed to Mean? by Allyn A. Young	144
Desirable Additions to Statistical Data on Wealth and Income, by Will- ford I. King	157

	PAGE
Discussion:	
D. R. Dewey	172
G. E. Roberts	173
R. L. Hale	174
The Situation of the United States at the Close of the European War— with Special Reference to the Gold Supply, by George E. Roberts..	176
Discussion:	
M. S. Wildman	192
E. M. Patterson	194
D. C. Barrett	197
G. E. Roberts	198
Loans and Taxes in War Finance, by O. M. W. Sprague	199
Discussion:	
E. T. Miller	214
H. I. Lutz	216
E. E. Lincoln	219
T. K. Urdahl	220
O. M. W. Sprague	222
The Place Which Accounting Should Occupy in any Scheme of National Preparedness, by John Raymond Wildman	224
Security Prices and the War, by Roger W. Babson	229
Problems of Population after the War, by James A. Field	233
The Redistribution of the Labor now Employed in Producing War Sup- plies, by Haviland H. Lund	238
Some Phases of the Minimum Wage Question, by James E. LeRossignol..	251
Discussion:	
A. B. Wolfe	275
R. L. Hale.....	279
J. A. Ryan.....	281
Minutes of Business Meetings	282
Report of the Secretary	283
Report of the Treasurer	285
Report of the Auditing Committee	287
Report of the Managing Editor of the American Economic Review.....	289
Report of the Committee on Prize Monographs	291
Report of the Committee on Methods of Arranging Programs for the An- nual Meetings	292